IWAN WMFFRE

MYNYTDAWC: RULER OF EDINBURGH?

DURING THE PERIOD 400-800 AD IN THE CELTIC REGIONS OF BRITAIN the ability to prove anything to the satisfaction of the historical discipline is severely hampered by the lack of contemporary sources. This basic fact is nowadays better understood than it was a hundred years ago, but we still come across statements concerning some aspect of these times which are plainly more the result of a burning desire to know rather than the results of a sober assessment of the extant documentation. I would like to underline the fact that in the following paper I am discussing possibilities and probabilities of interpretation and will not claim to have established an indisputable interpretation. I am not particularly attached to the implications of the interpretation concerning Mynydawc which unfolds below, but simply aim to explore a hitherto overlooked possible explanation of this enigmatic name.

The long-held identification of Mynydawc Mwynvawr as a sixth century British ruler has recently been put into question by Graham R. Isaac[1]. Whilst accepting the doubts he has

1. G.R. Isaac, *Mynyddawg Mwynfawr*, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», xxxvii, 1990, pp. 111-13.

raised regarding the interpretation of Mynydawc as a ruler, I am not convinced by his conclusion that Mynydawc Mwynvawr was a heroic hall, or court. More specifically I disagree with his unqualified assertions that Mynydawc was not a personal-name, e.g. «There is no reason to doubt that this is a place-names» («Nid oes lle i amau nad enw lle yw hwnnw») and, «menexec can only be an adjective [...] certainly there is no reason to suppose that it is a personal-name here» («Geill menexec fod yn ddim ond ansoddair [...] yn sicr nid oes le i dybio mai enw personol ydyw yma»)[2].

Support against the supposition that Mynydawc can only be a place-name is to be gleaned from the personal-name Meneduc, wife of Brychan Brycheiniog according to the Breton Life of Saint Herve (composed eighth-thirteenth century)[3]. If we can accept its authenticity Meneduc (Mynydawc) may be a feminine personal-name; but there is reason to doubt whether this interpretation is correct, not least the dubious aspects of the Life of Saint Herve –not the earliest of Breton sources – especially with regard to the commonplace appearance of Brychan Brycheiniog. It would be rash to assume on the above evidence that Mynydawc as a name must be feminine.

We find cognates of Mynydawc in a number of place-names. Certainly in the case of the Breton hamlet of Kervé-nézec+ (Pleyber-Christ, Finistère), seemingly related to the eleventh century place named Caer Menedoch[5], and possibly in

2. Ibidem; cf. also his review of J.T. Koch, The «Gododdin» of Aneirin. Text and Context from Dark-Age North Britain [Cardiff-Andover (MS)], University of Wales Press-Celtic Studies Publications, 1997], «Llên Cymru», XXII, 1999, pp. 138-160, 146.

3. L. Fleuriot, Les Origines de la Bretagne, Paris, Payot, 1980, p. 279.

4. Locally pronounced [kerve'nezek], M. Madeg, Renabl Anoiou Kêriadennou Bro-Leon hag o Distagadur, Brest, Engleo Breiz-Ar Skol Vezoneg, 1996, vol. II, p. 75.

5. A. de la Borderie, Cartulaire de l'Abbaye de Landévenec [1888], XXXVIII; J. Loth, Chrestomathie Bretonne (Armoricain, Gallois, Cornique), Paris, Bouillon, 1890, p. 152. Loth's reading is probably to be preferred over that of de la Borderie's, Caer Menedech.

the case of the hamlets of Ménéec[6] (le Cloître-Pleyben, Finistère) and Trévenec[7] (Carnoët, Côtes-d'Armor). In Cornwall there are two places named Trenethick, the historical antecedents of which are, Trevenedyk 1302, Trevenethek 1314 for the one in Wendron, and Trevenedek 1284, Trenythek 1382, Treneddyke 1474 for the one in Saint Germans[8]. In Scotland we have Abersnithock (near Kemnay, Aberdeenshire), written of old Eglismenythok 1211, Eglismeneyttok 1245, and corrupted by the sixteenth century to Abersnethok 1573[9]. Since names containing ecclesia north of the Antonine Wall have been connected with either – or both – the Picts and the Britons, rather than the Goidels[10], we have another place-name that could very well be a cognate of Mynydawc. Mynydawc (or Minidauc, the Old Welsh form preserved in lines 811 and 1219 of the Gododdin) is simply modern Welsh mynyddog, an adjective meaning 'mountainous, of/from the mountain', so that these place-names can respectively be interpreted as 'the mountainous fort' (or, if a later coining, 'the mountainous

6. Cf. the Breton surname (Le) Ménéec. F. Gourvil, Noms de Famille de Basse Bretagne, Paris, Editions D'Artrey, 1966, p. 141.

7. Ménéec, noted above, probably lost the medial [ð] (written x), in the same way. Otherwise one should be wary of connecting the many (le) Menec in western Brittany, as most, if not all, are derivatives of mên (cf. Welsh maen, meiniog). An alternative explanation could be that it is based on a word manac'heg (though the vocalism is difficult, *menec'heg being needed), similar to that found in the Cornish name Meneage. cf. O.J. Padel, A Popular Dictionary of Cornish Place-names, Penzance, Hodge, 1988, pp. 118-119.

8. J.E.B. Gover, The Place-names of Cornwall, Cambridge, University Press, 1948, pp. 224, 540, unpublished, which is to be found at the Royal Institution of Cornwall, Truro. I am indebted to O.J. Padel for bringing these place-names to my attention.

9. W.J. Watson, The History of the Celtic Place-names of Scotland, Edinburgh-London, William Blackwood & Sons, 1926, p. 331; W.M. Alexander, The Place-names of Aberdeenshire, Aberdeen, Spalding Club, 1952, p. 136.

10. G.W.S. Barrow, The Childhood of Scottish Christianity: A Note on Some Place-name Evidence, «Scottish Studies», XXVII, 1983, pp. 1-15.

settlement'), 'the mountainous settlement' and 'the mountainous church'. However, not only is this not true to style of Brittonic toponymic nomenclature, where to express this idea, the noun *mynydd* would do, but the location of these place-names cannot – by any stretch of the imagination – be described as particularly mountainous (*Eglismenythok* is near a mountain, though not a particularly notable one). It may therefore prove more judicious to interpret these place-names as containing a name and interpret them as 'the fort / settlement of Mynydawc', 'the settlement of Mynydawc' and 'the church of Mynydawc'.

I would like to put forward the possibility that Mynydawc Mwynvawr in the *Gododdin* is simply an epithet-turned-name of the Christian God. This would fit all the sparse references to Mynydawc in the *Gododdin* and the fact that it/he was not quoted present at the battle of Catraeth. This would also dispense G. R. Isaac's resort to the additional complication that, in certain contexts (*ar neges mynydawc, ar les mynydawc, o gussyl mynydawc, gan vynydawc*), reference is being made to the host of Mynydawc, rather than to Mynydawc it/himself. The interpretation of Mynydawc as the Christian God would sit happily with the place-name *Eglismenythok*, which would mean 'the church of God', to which one could compare the numerous examples of *Llanddewy* in Welsh, and *Villedieu* in French (to which the numerous Breton places named *Kergrist* seem to correspond). The Breton and Cornish place-name cognates need more methodical investigation before enduring conclusions can be reached[11].

The principal reason to doubt the existence of Mynydawc as a sixth century ruler lies in the fact that he does not appear in British royal genealogies[12]. Though *Trioedd Ynys Prydain*

11. For the Welsh place-name *Newydd-fynyddog* cf. Appendix.
12. P.C. BARTRUM (ed), *Early Welsh Genealogical Tracts*, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1966; IDEM, *Welsh Genealogies AD 300-1400*, Aberystwyth, The National Library of Wales, 1983.

does in fact mention *Gosgord Mynydauc Eidyn*, this is in a text containing acknowledged additions dating from the twelfth century[13]. John T. Koch is also suspicious as to Mynydawc's character in the *Gododdin*, who rightly notes that in the poems «in fact, he never does anything at all»,[14] and argues that the personage called *Urfei* (B) / *Erfei* (A) has a better claim to be considered the contemporary ruler of Edinburgh[15]. G. R. Isaac, on the other hand, makes the case for *Gwlyget Gododin* / *Gulgaut Gododin* being Edinburgh's ruler[16]. Slight evidence can be marshalled for both these individuals as ruler of *Gododdin* in the poems, and J. T. Koch later surmised that *Urfei* may have been the British ruler and *Gwlyget* a military leader with an English father[17], this is a possibility allowed, in turn, by G. R. Isaac, who nevertheless prefers to interpret these two individuals as rulers of Edinburgh from two different eras chronologically conflated into the unhistorical poems[18]. To me an added point of doubt as to Mynydawc being Edinburgh's ruler is the number of other 'rulers' seemingly alluded to as members of his warband that set out to attack Catraeth[19]. As they are part of the 'retinue' (W. *gosgordd*) of Mynydawc, one wonders whether British 'rulers' would really have

13. R. BROMWICH, *Trioedd Ynys Prydain*, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1978, p. 65; the most obvious late accretions to the *Trioedd* being the personages of *Alan Fergant* (+1119), and *Gilbert de Clare* (+1114?) [CXII-CXIII]; J.T. KOCH, *Thoughts on the «U-Gododdin»: Rethinking Aneirin and Mynyddawc Mwynmawr*, «Language Sciences», XV, 1993, pp. 81-89, p. 86 believes, as I do, that these mentions are «lifted directly» from the *Gododdin*.
14. Ibidem, p. 86.
15. Ibidem.
16. Isaac, Ibidem.
17. J.T. KOCH, *The «Gododdin» of Aneirin. Text and Context from Dark-Age North Britain*, Cardiff-Andover (MS), University of Wales Press-Celtic Studies Publications, 1997, p. XLVIII.
18. Isaac, review of KOCH, p. 147.
19. A.O.H. JARMAN, *Aneirin: Y Gododdin. Britain's Oldest Heroic Poem*, Llandysul, Gomer, 1988, p. XXXVI.

put themselves so harmoniously under the direction of one their equals; that is, Mynydawc, ruler of *Dineidyn*. Though this is not at all impossible, it is rather more probable that these assorted 'rulers', in their war against the pagan English, could more easily have given their allegiance to the Christian god, rather than to a more wordly potentate.

An article by D. S. Evans[20] throws doubts upon the genuineness of some of the Christian references in the *Gododdin*, but mistakenly asserts that the combination of Christian and heroic ideals is «incongruous», and states that it is probable the original poem of the *Gododdin* was «a pure unmixed heroic poem» («cerdd arwrol bur diledryw»). However there is no reason to doubt the presence, or relevance, of Christianity in this period amongst the men of the *Gododdin*[21]. J. T. Koch has indeed questioned the accepted wisdom that the *Gododdin* relates to a primarily ethnic campaign by Britons against advancing Anglo-Saxons and emphasises, convincingly enough, that the period in which the campaign was set was characterised by wars that were primarily dynastically motivated[22]. Notwithstanding the undoubted momentum of dynas-

20. *Aneirin - Bardd Cristnogol?*, «Ysgrifau Beirniadol», x, 1977, pp. 35-44.

21. Cf. JARMAN, *Y Gododdin*, pp. XLVI, LVII, LVI-LX, and also M. HAYCOCK, *Blodeugerdd Barddas o Ganu Crefyddol Cymar*, Swansea, Cyhoeddiadau Barddas, 1994, pp. XIII-XIV for refutations of this view. KOCH (*Thoughts on the «Ur-Gododdin»*, p. 88) argues that the archaic poem *Trawsganu Kynan* «[...] is also devoid of Christian terminology and concept», from which he interprets lack of Christian motif as a feature of archaism in Old Welsh poems. In *Trawsganu Kynan* the lack of Christian motifs can be explained alternatively by the fact that Kynan is shown to be fighting fellow Christian Britons rather than pagan English, and in this case resort to Christian motifs would be considered inappropriate. In my view, the debate of Christian nature versus Pagan nature of early Welsh poetry is a rather sterile one, as there seems no *a priori* reason that every poem had to resort to Christian imagery, or conversely had to ignore it. Furthermore G.R. ISAAC, «*Trawsganu Kynan Garwyn mab Brochwel*»: *a tenth-century political poem*, 1999, argues that *Trawsganu Kynan* is not such an archaic poem and quite plausibly dates the poem to the tenth century.

22. KOCH, *The «Gododdin»*, pp. XVIII-XLII (especially XXXV-XLII).

tic politics, one should not downplay the ethnic antipathy of Britons and Anglo-Saxons to each other, and it would be the most natural thing for this antipathy to be expressed by the Britons through resorting to their Christian faith as an added justification for war against pagan Anglo-Saxons[23].

Support for an identification of Mynydawc as a name for the Christian God may come from the 5th-early 6th century inscribed stone in Llanaber, Merionethshire[24]. It is inscribed:

CAELEXTI
MONEDO
RIGI

And though this has been translated «[The stone] of Caelestis Monedorix», by V. E. Nash-Williams[25], or as a personal-name, *Caelestis*, with an epithet[26], we should keep in mind a neglected article by L. Fleuriot, which shows that the translation of Celtic epithets into Latin on inscribed stones (and seemingly vice-versa) was not unknown[27].

If we accept *caelexti* (Latin *caelestis*) as a (partial) translation of *monedorigi* (Modern Welsh *mynydd*, and *rhi*), we must posit a figurative semantic equivalence between *mynydd* and

23. Analogy with historical scenarios from many countries and many periods should be enough to convince one that alliances of the moment between Britons and Anglo-Saxons against co-nationals cannot be taken to disprove the existence of deep-seated ethnic antagonisms. Indeed KOCH (*The «Gododdin»*, p. XXXVI) has no problem in allowing the same Britons traditional feelings of ethnic antagonism against the pagan Irish and pagan Picts.

24. V.E. NASH-WILLIAMS, *The Early Christian Monuments of Wales*, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1950, p. 166.

25. Ibidem, pp. 7, 166.

26. M. RICHARDS in *Atlas Meirionnydd*, ed. G. BOWEN, Y Bala, Llyfrau'r Faner, 1975ª, p. 28.

27. *Notes sur le celtique antique: I. Traductions latines d'epithètes divines gauloises*, «Études Celtiques», XIX, 1982, pp. 121-126.

heaven, cf. *dwfn*²⁸, and *llawr*²⁹ used figuratively for the 'earth'. A similar semantic shift of usage is found in Dafydd ab Gwilym's poetry with the word *bryn*³⁰.

The Breton cognate of Welsh *glyn* and Irish *gleann*, both 'valley'³¹, evolved to mean the 'world' by the Middle Breton period; L. Fleuriot noted the Middle Breton phrase *Goae da glen* 'woe to your world!', upon which he remarked «*glen* [...] signifie 'vallée', puis 'ici-bas', enfin le 'monde', sens le plus usuel en breton-moyen»³². Thus *Mynydawc* can be understood as 'exalted' and 'celestial, from heaven, heavenly', a fitting designation for the Christian god. I strongly suspect that the inscription on the Llanaber stone does not commemorate the burial of a person named *Caelexti Monedorigi*, nor even of two persons named *Caelexti* and *Monedorigi*, but is rather a reference in two languages to the Christian God. Coincidental to our argumentation, the base form of the Latin word in the

28. *Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru*, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1950- sub. *dwfn* 2, it is also present in the Welsh personal-names *Dyfnwal* and *Dyfnog annwfn, annwn*, 'un-world' or world within', i.e. 'the other world'; cf. Old Irish *domun* 'world'. Nevertheless its basic and usual meaning is 'deep', to which English word it is cognate.

29. Cf. the thirteenth century *radau crynei nef a llawr* quoted by M. Haycock, *The Significance of the «Cad Goddau» Tree-list in the Book of Taliesin*, in *Celtic Linguistics. Reading in the Brythonic Languages. Festschrift for T. Arwyn Watkins*, ed. M.J. Ball – J. Fife – E. Poppe – J. Rowland, Amsterdam-Philadelphia, J. Benjamins Pub. Co, 1990, p. 324.

30. «35. *bryn*. Or ystyr gyffredin y nae'n ymddangos ddyfod yr ystyr 'uchelder, amlygrwydd'. Yn y testun nid yr un uchelder neu urddas sydd i febyn ac i llynaif». [«*bryn*. The meaning 'height, prominence' appears to derive from the common meaning. In the text it is not the same lightness or dignity that belongs to a youth as to elders»]: T. Parry (ed.) *Gwaith Dafydd ap Gwilym*, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1952, p. 454 note 35.

31. With the latter often used in contrast with *sliabh* 'mountain' in Irish: cf. L. Mac Mathúna, *Old Irish Heights and Word-Field Potential*, «Studia Hibernica», XXIV, 1988, pp. 37, 43-44.

32. L. Fleuriot, «Études Celtiques», XIX, 1982, pp. 265-266.

inscription – *viz. c(o)eli* 'heaven' – gave *Celi* in Welsh, another designation of the Christian god³³.

A perusal of matter containing a comparative treatment of religions yields many examples of the connection of mountains with 'heaven':

Mountains have an important place in the symbolic geography of religious traditions the world over, although the ways in which mountains are significant have differed. Some have been seen as cosmic mountains, central to an entire worldview; others have been distinguished as places of revelation and vision, as divine dwelling places, or even as geographical manifestations of the divine³⁴.

I would like to emphasise the common equation of mountains as divine dwelling places – a 'heaven' in some sort – examples being the gods of the ancient Greeks residing on Mount Olympus, the linking of mountains to spirits by many native Amerindian traditions, the mountains as the traditional home of spirits in Swiss lore, the mountain gods and divine mountains of China and Japan³⁵. More particularly I would like to focus on the Hebrew tradition of mountains as the dwelling place of the divine³⁶. R. J. Clifford describes the function of the mountain in ancient Middle Eastern religious traditions thus:

Some mountains named in mythic and religious texts signify more than a mere geographical elevation. In the ancient civilizations from Egypt to India and beyond, the mountain can be a center of fertility, the primeval hillock of creation, the meeting place of the gods, the dwelling place of the high god, the meeting place of heaven and earth, the monument effectively upholding the order of creation, the place of theophany³⁷.

33. Haycock, *Blodeugerdd Barddas*, p. 21.
34. *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. M. Eliade, New York-London, Macmillan, 1987, vol. x, p. 130.
35. *Ibidem*, vol. IV, p. 288; vol. VI, p. 62; vol. x, pp. 170, 132.
36. *Ibidem*, vol. x, pp. 132-33.
37. R.J. Clifford, *The Cosmic Mountain in Canaan and the Old Testament*, Harvard, Harvard University Press, 1972, p. 5.

The tradition among Canaanites that the mountain was the place where the high god El issued decisions that affected the order and running of the cosmos influenced the subsequent Israelite traditions of Mount Sinai / Horeb where the high god Yahweh issued his laws to Moses[38]. The connection of the Christian God with mountains was not unknown in Dark Age Insular tradition, witness the testimony of Old Irish glosses to the Old Testament Psalms, dating to about c. 800 where we find:

The attributing of 'eternal' to the mountains is discussed in the Latin commentary and the relevant Irish gloss reads: (xii) .i. dindi rombói hi slebib 'i.e. from that He was in mountains' (Ml. 95 a 3). This is an affirmation of God's affinity for mountains[39].

The case for the translating of names (or epithets) into Latin in the wording of some early Christian inscriptions in the Brittonic world can be made from other examples. The clearest of which is the Llanfallteg stone[40] (Carms.). It is inscribed:

MEMORIA
VOTEPORIGIS[41]
PROTICTORIS

This commemoratory inscription of the mid-fifth century king of Dyfed has led to one of the most commonly quoted

38. Ibidem, pp. 19, 107-23.
39. Quoted in Mac MATHÚNA Old Irish Heights, p. 38: the gloss is placed about the asterisk in «aeternos autem montes appellat quod pro sempeterna uirtute in se dei habitantis numquam essent in iis hostium transituri, unde* uelut respiciens diuinitas securitatem maistatis adflaueribt»: Thesaurus Palaeohibernicus, ed. W. STOKES - J. STRACHAN, Cambridge, University Press, vol. 1, 1901, p. 323; the manuscript is thought by the editors [p. xvi] to emanate from the monastery of Bangor (Co. Down).
40. NASH-WILLIAMS, Early Christian Monuments of Wales, p. 107.
41. Ogam votecorigas.

ideas concerning Roman continuity in sub-Roman Britain. In 1911 J. E. Lloyd in his History of Wales[42] stated that Voteporix had «[...] the title of 'protector', bestowed by the Romans in the declining years of their Empire upon notable barbarian leaders and no doubt borne by Voteporix hereditarily».

K. H. Jackson continued further along this line of speculation:

This sixth-century petty Irish king of south-west Wales was called on his gravestone by the high imperial title of Protector, to which one would scarcely suppose he could have had any right. This is not the only tomb in the world which makes out a man to be more important than he really was, but the significant thing is that it took the direction of pretending to be a high-ranking Roman. / The late Mr. M. P. Charlesworth pointed out to me that the Romans often gave allied barbarian kings some sort of title, status and insignia, and suggested that the rank of Protector may have been bestowed on one of Voteporix's ancestors during the Empire, and that the family claimed it hereditarily afterwards [...]. This is very ingenious and plausible, and would explain the occurrence of it in Britain at so late a date[43].

What has not been stressed is that protictoris is a partial translation of voteporigis (Modern Welsh godeb and rht). Proinsias Mac Cana did note the semantic equivalence («tebygrwydd semantegol» of godeb 'hiding place, retreat, refuge' with Latin protego)[44] but without pushing this point to its logical conclusion. Though K. H. Jackson would subsequently change his mind[45], most commentators have continued to express the view that protictoris is a title, and one can say this

42. London, Longmans & Green, vol. 1, p. 133.
43. K.H. JACKSON, Language and History in Early Britain: a Chronological Survey of the Brittonic Languages, 1st to 12th c. AD, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1953, p. 175.
44. P. MAC CANA, *Votepori, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», xix, 1961, pp. 116-117.
45. «This has been much discussed, including the unlikely proposition that Voteporix actually held an official Roman appointment and the title of Protector»: K.H. JACKSON, Gildas and the Names of British Princes, «Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies», iii, 1982, p. 32.

is still the accepted wisdom in histories of sub-Roman Britain[46].

Another stone (early seventh century) at Llangadwaladr (Angl.)[47] is inscribed:

CATAMANUS
REX SAPIENTISI
MUS OPINATISIM
US OMNIUM REG
UM

The second component of the pn. *catamanus* (Welsh *Cadfan*) was understood by Ifor Williams[48] to be related to Celtic MAND(U)-, meaning 'wise, learning, thinking'[49]. If so, we could interpret *sapientismus*, not so much as a title or epithet, but as another partial translation.

As for the epithet *mwynfawr* often tagged to Mynydawc in the poems, it is also unproblematic insofar as it meant *rich*, *opulent*, etc. It is also found as epithet to the names of three 'rulers' in the Welsh genealogies[50] *Elidyr Mwynfawr* and *Morgan Mwynfawr*, descendants of Dyfnwal Hen of the Old North, who supposedly flourished about the sixth century; and to Rhys ab Gruffudd, of Deheubarth, who died in 1197. It may be thought that such an epithet primarily referred to earthly princely attributes – and there is nothing improbable

46. S. JOHNSON, *Later Roman Britain*, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1980, pp. 84, 206; J. DAVIES, *Hanes Cymru*, London, Penguin, 1990, p. 52; J.T. KOCH, *«Colhaircheu, Esposito's Theory, and Neo-Celtic Lenition»*, in *Britain 400-600: Language and History*, ed. A. Bammesberger – A. Wollmann, Heidelberg, Winter, 1990, pp. 179-202, 190.

47. NASH-WILLIAMS, *Early Christian Monuments of Wales*, p. 57, and p. CIIC, note 970.

48. *The Personal Names in the Early Anglesey Inscriptions* [1937], reprinted in IDEM, *The Beginnings of Welsh Poetry*, ed. R. Bromwich, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, pp. 16-24, 19.

49. D.E. EVANS, *Gaulish Personal Names. A Study of Some Continental Celtic Formations*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1967, pp. 222-223.

50. BARTRUM, *Early Welsh Genealogical Tracts*.

in such assertions – but this constitutes no argument against seeing it as a perfectly acceptable epithet for the 'Prince of Heaven.' Ifor Williams demonstrates that *mwynfawr* was also applied to Jesus Christ[51], and it is well known to comparative linguists that in Slavic languages a term *bhag-* 'to assign, distribute'[52] replaced the original Indo-European term *DEIU-[53] to denote the Christian God so that we find its reflex in Polish as *Bóg* 'God' but also as 'rich' in derivatives such as *bogacz* 'rich man', *bogaty* 'rich, wealthy', *bogactwo* 'riches'[54].

The basic arguments of this article were already assembled by 1991 in response to G. R. Isaac's article; it only came later to my notice that J. T. Koch was also interested in the interpretation of Mynydawc. His article *Thoughts on the Ur-Gododin: rethinking Aneirin and Mynydawc Mwynvawr* put forward the case for interpreting *mynydawc* as a common adjective 'pertaining to a mountain or mountains':

That is what I think *mynydawc mwynvawr* means – the luxurious mountain court, the mountain retinue, the mountain feast, sometimes the luxurious mountain chief (whose real name was *Yrien*), also the luxurious mountain country, and especially, luxurious Castle Rock Edinburgh. [...] So, I now favour using lower-case *ms* for *mynydawc mwynvawr*[55].

This interpretation is not to be lightly dismissed, but I am disconcerted by the rather loose identification of *mynydawc* in the 1993 article, translated variously as *Edinburgh* (more specifically *Castle Rock*), *Mynydd Eidyn*, or *Lothian*. In his 1997 book J. T. Koch multiplies the translations of *mynydawc* vari-

51. I. WILLIAMS, *Dwy gân o Lyfr Coch Talgarth*, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», II, 1924, pp. 118-30, specifically pp.199-30.

52. J. POKORNY, *Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch*, Bern, Francke, 1949-1969, 2 vols., p. 107.

53. Ibidem, pp. 185-86.

54. Pokorny also points out that *deus ~ diuus*, the Latin reflexes of *DEIU-*, had a by-form *diuus* 'rich': ibidem, p. 185.

55. KOCH, *Thoughts on the «Ur-Gododdin»*, p. 87.

ously as 'mountain citadel', 'mountain stronghold', 'mountain court', 'mountain feast', 'mountain chief', 'mountain country', 'highland zone' (nor does he refuse 'mountain hall' a meaning close to G. R. Isaac's interpretation)[56].

Both I. Williams and J. T. Koch[57] point out that Edinburgh – usually *Dún Éideann* in Scottish-Gaelic[58] – had as an alternative name *Dún Monaidh* in 1565. This was connected by I. Williams to the c. 1250 mention of *Minit Eidin* in the *Black Book of Carmarthen*[59] – which was indubitably in the same general area as Edinburgh. But *Monadh* as W. J. Watson pointed out[60] originally referred to the mountainous part of Scotland, and was later applied, in a wider sense, to the kingdom of Scotland: *Dún Monaidh* 'the fortress of Monadh' was accounted by early and legendary Irish material as the seats of the kings of Alba. W. J. Watson believed[61] that «[...] the probability is that *Dún Monaidh* was used loosely to denote the seat of the Gaelic kings of Scotland wherever it might be placed», and that the late identification by an author of *Dún Monaidh* with Edinburgh «probably means simply that Edinburgh was in his time the seat of the king of Scotland». Even if Edinburgh could be accounted the original *Dún Monaidh* – which is doubtful – its name would derive from *Monadh* (E. The Mount) which was the original name given to the Grampians, or central Highlands, by Scottish-Gaelic speakers, and not to the environs of Edinburgh. *Monadh* in Scottish-Gaelic is a loanword from the pre-Gaelic speakers of northern

56. IDEM, *The «Gododdin»*, pp. XLV-XLVII.
57. I. WILLIAMS, *Canu Aneirin*, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1938, p. XXXVIII; KOCH, *Thoughts on the «Ur-Gododdin»*, p. 87.
58. In Welsh tradition, *Dineidyn* or *Dinaseidyn* (cf. WILLIAMS, *Canu Aneirin*, pp. XXXVII, XXXIX).
59. WATSON, *The History of the Celtic Place-names of Scotland*, p. 67.
60. Ibidem, p. 391.
61. Ibidem, p. 395.

Scotland, cognate with W. *mynydd* 'mountain'[62]. The Old and Middle Welsh term for the Scottish Highlands may have been Old Welsh (*montem*) *Bannauc*, Middle Welsh *Mynyd Bannawc*, or simply Middle Welsh *Bannauc* (Modern Welsh *Bannog*)[63]. If *mynydd* – as a simplex – was ever a specific geographical

62. W.F.H. NICHOLAISEN, *The Picts and Their Place-names*, Inverness, Groam House Museum, 1996, p. 26.
63. A passage in the Welsh saint's life, *Uita Cadoci*, located Cadog's church south of *Bannog*, the location of *Bannog* has then hinged on the identification of this church with the church of Cambuslang, near Glasgow, also dedicated to Cadog (argumentation given by K.H. Jackson, *The Gododdin: The Oldest Scottish Poem*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1969, pp. 78-79). Taking Cambuslang as the church of Cadog mentioned in the *Uita Cadoci*, led A.P. FORBES, *Kalendars of Scottish Saints: with personal Notices of those of Alba, Laudonia and Strathclyde*, Edinburgh, Edmonston & Douglas, 1872, p. 293, to identify *Bannog* with the Cathkin Hills between Ayrshire and Strathclyde, on the strength of the place-name *Carmunnok*; WATSON (*The History of the Celtic Place-names of Scotland*, p. 196), on the strength of the same reference in *Uita Cadoci* identified *Bannog* with the Cargunnock Hills and Campsie Fells between Stirling and Glasgow, an argument taken up by JACKSON, *The Gododdin*, pp. 5-6: «It is the massif which almost entirely blocks the narrow neck of Scotland between Stirling and Dumbarton, consisting of the Fintry, Kilsyth, Campsie, and Kilpatrick Hills; the Bannock Burn, which takes its name from this range, flows out of the Fintry Hills into the Forth near Stirling. The hero from 'beyond Bannog' came, therefore, from the country of the Picts, which began north of the Forth and the Bannog Hills». Despite the reasonable nature of the arguments for this location, I. WILLIAMS, *Canu Llywarch Hen*, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1935, pp. 156-57, felt – as I do – that the Grampians best suited the Middle Welsh references to *Bannog*, though he played safe in *Enwau Lleoedd* (Liverpool, Hugh Evans, 1945) with his – probably intentionally – vague description of *Bannog* as «y rhes o fynyddoedd ar draws perfedd yr Alban» [«the range of mountains running across the middle of Scotland»]. My reason for preferring the Highlands to the 'hill' ranges between Dumbarton and Stirling is guided by the fact that since nearly every peak in those highlands is named *beann* – the Scottish-Gaelic cognate of Welsh *ban* – the adjective *bannog* is an eminently suitable description of these mountains. The adjective *tra Bannog*, 'beyond Bannog', found in Welsh literature, serving as a topos for what constituted for the Britons the most remote area of Britain (it seems unlikely that the area of Pictland lying immediately north of Stirling could really be considered remote by the Britons).

designation in Welsh, it is highly unlikely that it would have excluded the Highlands which is the 'mountain' *par excellence* in northern Britain. If one would want to ascribe a geographical quality to Mynydawc in the *Gododdin*, it is more than likely that one would have to connect it with *Monadh*, the land of the Highlands and by extension the kingdom of Alba, the land of the Picts, later the Gaels, which was patently not the case of the area of *Eidyn, Lleuddinion* (E. Lothian), and *Gododdin*, all part of the present 'Lowlands' area, which was the land of the Britons.

If we maintain that Mynydawc has a geographical significance, we cannot ignore *Mönit Eidin* which I. Williams identified[64] with either *Castle Rock* or *Arthur's Seat* (ca. 253 m.); and cross-referenced with *Eidin vre* (l. 1224), *Eidyn gaer* (l. 1385), *esgor Eidin* (l. 144), *Eidyn ysgor* (l. 113) in his edition of the poems. J. T. Koch's interpretation is that *mynydawc*, in this sense, alludes to the mountainous nature of Edinburgh, or the district around it. But *mynydd* is not (*pace* J. T. Koch and M. Todd) an indisputably befitting distinctive description of the location of Edinburgh, for both of the contemporary defensive works of Traprain Law and Stirling are in quite similar elevated positions. W. J. Watson's identification[65] of *Mönit Eidin* with the Braid Hills south of Edinburgh is neither objectionable nor tantalising. The most cogent reason for refusing a geographical explanation of Mynydawc in the poems is that the meaning 'rich, opulent' of *mwynfawr*, the epithet often tagged to it in the poems, is particularly unsuitable adjective for a mountain or a mountainous area.

Thus while Mynydawc Mwynvawr has been construed as the name of the ruler of Edinburgh by leading scholars of the *Gododdin* up to the present[66], or else recently as the name of a

64. WILLIAMS, *Canu Aneirin*, p. XXXVIII.
65. WATSON, *The History of the Celtic Place-names of Scotland*, p. 341.
66. I have already mentioned the medieval reference to *Gogord Mynydau Eidyn* in the *Trioedd* (cf. pp. IV-V). Scholarly views are listed below: E.

renowned opulent hall[67], or even, simply, an adjective meaning 'of the mountain' (referring to Edinburgh or its environs[68]; or the 'Highlands' of Scotland) there is a possibility that Mynydawc (Mwynvawr) in the *Gododdin* can be identified with the Christian God, an interpretation which would go some way to answer K. H. Jackson's perplexity that whilst there are some references to Christianity in the *Gododdin* «[...] it is remarkable that God himself is nowhere mentioned»[69].

Since the appearance in the 1990s of new arguments by G.R. Isaac and J. T. Koch the once generally accepted interpretation of the *Gododdin* poems established by Ifor Williams in 1938 is in some flux. For clarity's sake I wish only to say that I tend to view the *Gododdin* poems as mostly literary

67. EVANS, *Some Specimens of the Poetry of the Ancient Welsh Bards*, London, R. and J. Dodsley, 1764, p. 63, «ANEURIN in suo poemate cui titulus *Gododdin* refert se in bello juxta *Cattraeth* sub auspiciis MYNYDDAWC EIDIN, bellum adversus Saxones gessisse»; E. JONES, *Musical and Poetical Reliks of the Welsh Bards*, London, the author, 1794² (1st ed. 1784), p. 4, «under the patronage of *Mynyddawg* of Ediniborough, a prince of the North»; S. TURNER, *Vindication of the Genuineness of the Ancient British Poetry of Aneurin, Taliesin, Llywarch Hen, and Myrddin*, London, E. Williams, 1803, p. 52, «Now Aneurin, in many places, mentions Mynyduc as the leader of the Britons»; J. WILLIAMS AB ITHEL, *Aneirin. Y Gododin: a Poem on the Battle of Catraeth*, Llandovery, W. Rees, 1852, p. 6 «Mynyddawg, lord of Eiddin, whose dominions lay peculiarly exposed, both by sea and land, to the attack of the enemy»; T.H. DE LA VILLEMARQUÉ, *Bardes Bretons: Poèmes du VI siècle*, Paris, Didier, 1860, p. LIX, «Ménézok, roi d'Edinburg, généralissime des confédérés», P. 232: «Ménézok, autre chef de guerre illustre»; T. STEPHENS (1821-1875) in T. POWEL (ed.) *The Gododin of Aneurin Gwawdrydd*, London, Whiting & co., 1888, pp. 31, 33, 161-163; W.F. SKENE, *The Four Ancient Books of Wales Containing the Kymric Poems Attributed to the Bards of the Sixth Century*, Edinburgh, Edmonston and Douglas, 1864-1868, talks of «two heroes disguised under the epithets of Caeawg and Mynyddawg» (vol. II, 1868, p. 363) and tentatively «if so Mynyddawg was Aidan, king of Dalriada», (vol. II, p. 369); WILLIAMS, *Canu Aneirin*, p. XXIV, XL, JACKSON, *The Gododdin*, p. 4; JARMAN, *Y Gododdin*, pp. XVIII, XXI.
68. ISAAC, *Mynyddawg Mwynfawr*, pp. 111-13.
69. KOCH, *Thoughts on the «Ur-Gododdin»*, pp. 86-87.
70. JACKSON, *The Gododdin*, p. 37.

creation not contemporary with the facts they purport to relate, with the qualification, however, that they do contain some genuine archaic material originating from northern Britain, at least in names and in Brittonic words or usages not attested elsewhere in Welsh literature. Beyond the disagreements as to what Mynydawc in the poem represents, the latest views – arrived at independently[70] – converge towards one salient conclusion: that, as J.T. Koch puts it, there is «a compelling and straightforward» case that the old view of Mynydawc as a sixth century ruler of Edinburgh can hardly be sustained uncritically on the basis of the surviving documentation.

APPENDIX

In Wales we have a problematic place-name *Newydd-fynyddog* (SH 90-00, Llanbrynmair, Monts.), which was written, *Negued Uenedauc* 1191[71], *Mynidd Vynyddog, Mynydd Vannyddog, Newidd Ffynoddog, Newidd Ffynuddog* 1683-87[72], *Newydd Fynyddoedd* (sic) Ordinance Survey 1836, *Newydd Fynydog* Ordinance Survey 1903[73], and was

70. KOCH, *The «Gododdin»*, at p. XLV, note 2, states: «I first exposed my doubts about *mynyðawc* as a person at a seminar in Harvard in 1986 [...] The fact that Isaac and I reached largely the same conclusion independently underscores the compelling and straightforward nature of the case». I myself was inspired to write this article through being presented at an informal conversation between students at Aberystwyth University about 1987; G. R. Isaac proposed his views about Mynydawc, later published in his article of 1990, whilst another student of Celtic Studies, Muiris Mag Ualghairg, preferred to interpret Mynydawc as the Christian God.

71. *Montgomery Collections*, vol. 51 p. 167. The <g> of the form *Negued* seems a relic of Old Welsh orthography just like the <g> in the form of a witness's name in the same charter *Bledgint* for later *Bleddyn*.

72. D.M. ELLIS, *Astudiaeth o Enwau Lleoedd Sir Drefaldwyn*, unpublished MA Thesis, University of Wales, 1935, p. 697.

73. 6" Ordinance Survey map, 2nd ed.

noted as pronounced [newɪð vənˈəðog] in 1935[74]. It is the name of a mountainous tract between Talerddig, Pont Dolgadfan and Pont Dol-fach, now fenced in between 9 adjoining farms[75], and described as a *common* in 1683-87[76], and as *sheep walks* in 1839[77]. Its meaning, which seems clear from all sources is 'new(ly) mountainous' which seems nonsensical unless those who bestowed the name witnessed a volcanic eruption. Even if *Mynyddog* is taken as a personal or place-name, the placement of *newydd*, the adjective, at the beginning of the place-name is wholly particular to this place-name[78]. The toponymist D. M. Ellis was clearly perplexed by it[79]. Even after conjecturing that Mynyddog was a name rather than an adjective, he was still puzzled by the other element: «However it is difficult to understand the significance of the element *newydd* in the name» [«Eithr anodd deall arwyddocad yr elfen *newydd* yn yr enw»][80].

Perhaps *newydd* itself is a noun or name, for which one may refer to the Breton parish name *Nevez* (Finistère), *Neu(e)* in Breton, and *Neued, Plebs Nevez* (11th century), *Neguet* (1368), *Neguez* (1395)[81]. It has been conjectured that *Nevez* is a contraction of an original **Plone-nevez* 'new parish', though it is rather irregular in contractions of Brittonic place-names for the noun to give way to an adjec-

74. ELLIS, *Astudiaeth o Enwau Lleoedd Sir Drefaldwyn*, p. 697 (which would be written by me, in a more modern phonetic script [newɪð vənˈəðog]).

75. Newydd-fynyddog and the adjoining farms belonged to the estate of Watkin Wynn of Wynnstay, but was sold about the time of the 1914–1918 war (p.c. Penry Williams).

76. Ibidem.

77. Llanbrynmair Tithe Map, National Library of Wales.

78. The adjective *newydd* 'new' is common in Welsh before a verb-noun or sometimes before a noun – e.g. *newydd ddod* 'just come'; *newydd fflam* 'brand new' – but not before an adjective.

79. «It Is difficult to understand why one has two adjectives as a mountain name. Should one suspect the loss of an element such as *carn*, *carnedd* (a feminine noun to account for the mutation of the initial consonant of *mynyddog*)?» [«Anodd deall paham y ceir dau ansoddair fel enw ar fynydd. A raid tybio colli o ryw elfen fel *carn, carnedd* (enw benywaidd i gyfrif am y treiglad o gytsain flaenaf *mynyddog*)?»]: ELLIS, *Astudiaeth o Enwau Lleoedd Sir Drefaldwyn*, p. 697.

80. Ibidem.

81. B. TANGUY, *Dictionnaire des noms de communes, trèves, et paroisses du Finistère: origine et signification*, Douarnenez, Le Chasse Marée, 1990, p. 137.

tive. We are thus at a loss to give anything approaching a satisfactory explanation to *Newydd-fynyddog*.

The famed Welsh poet Richard Davies (1833-77) adopted his bardic-name *Mynyddog* in 1855 from *Newydd-fynyddog*[82]; maybe he was directly inspired to take his name from this nearby mountain following the discovery (in the 1850s) of an ancient *cist-faen* containing bones on *Newydd-fynyddog*[83]. *Newydd-fynyddog* was certainly noted for the ancient megalithic monuments on its summit:

Yr Allor	'the altar'	
Cerrygcaerau	'the stones of the ramparts'	a circle of 8 stones
Lledcroen-yr-ych	'the skin-spreader of the ox'	a stone circle consisting of 6 stones

The last name was due to a legend connected with the *Ychen Bannog*, the giant horned oxen of Welsh legend, and seems to show the folk interpretation of the stones as pegs that would stretch (Welsh *lledu*) the skins of the giant ox[84].

It would be enlightening to know whether Richard Davies abstracted *Mynyddog* from *Newydd-fynyddog* or whether the place-name itself had become *Mynyddog*. This could be the result of a regular contraction of *Newydd-fynyddog* in Welsh (ruled by the penultimate stress-accent) which would give **Newydd-'nyddog* > **New'-'nyddog* > **Ny'nyddog* > **'Nyddog*[85], subsequently reformed with semantic considerations in mind to *Mynyddog*. I am led to believe that the pronunciation [mə'nəðɔg] or *[nəðɔg] exist from the various pronunciations heard by me from Penry Williams (a native of Carno) who has farmed Lluest for many a year, and whose wife was from Cwmcalch-isa, a neighbouring farm. I must stress that the full form – *viz. Newydd-fynyddog* – is known and that it is difficult to disentangle the full (or literary) form from the local habitual colloquial form (if it exists) as I am not an inhabitant of the area and have not been there often enough. However, the pronunciations I did hear were: 1) [mə'nəðɔg] on my first visit; 2) [mɛnð mə'nəðɔg] and [nɛwið mə'nəðɔg] on my second visit (note the lack of lenition of /m/ of

82. M.A. BENNETT, *Astudiaeth o Waith Llenorion Plwyf Llanbryn-mair a'r Cylch 1850-1914*, MA Thesis, University of Wales, 1983, p. 271.
83. *Ibidem*, pp. 5-6.
84. *Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru*, s.v. *lledaf: lledu*, cf. *pren lledu* s.v. *pren*.
85. The Welsh of the Montgomeryshire area, along with that of north-eastern Wales, contrasts with other varieties of Welsh by a stronger incidence of complete elision of the prepenultimate syllable, e.g. *ceffylau* > *'ffylau, cysidro* > *'sidro*.

mynyddog in the second example), as well as [nɛw'nəðɔg] on one occasion (though it must be owned that it could just have been a passing and untypical contraction on the part of the speaker).

Despite the hints that the name was shortened the evidence given above on the local pronunciation remains inconclusive. Only a further spell of field-work among other old inhabitants of the immediate neighbourhood could establish the traditional local pronunciation.

REFERENCES

ALEXANDER, W.M., *The Place-names of Aberdeenshire*, Aberdeen, Spalding Club, 1952.

BARROW, G.W.S., *The Childhood of Scottish Christianity: A Note on Some Place-name Evidence*, «Scottish Studies», XXVII, 1983, pp.1-15.

BARTRUM, P.C. (ed.), *Early Welsh Genealogical Tracts*, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1966.

—, *Welsh Genealogies AD 300-1400*, Aberystwyth, The National Library of Wales, 1983.

BENNETT, M.A., *Astudiaeth o Waith Llenorion Plwyf Llanbryn-mair a'r Cylch* [1888] XXXVIII.

BORDERIE, A DE LA, *Cartulaire de l'Abbaye de Landévenec 1850-1914*, MA Thesis, University of Wales, 1983.

BOWEN, G. (ed.), *Atlas Meirionydd*, ed. Y Bala, Llyfrau'r Faner, 1975².

BRONWICH, R., *Trioedd Ynys Prydain*, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1978.

CLIFFORD, R.J., *The Cosmic Mountain in Canaan and the Old Testament*, Harvard, Harvard University Press, 1972.

DAVIES, J., *Hanes Cymru*, London, Penguin, 1990.

ELIADE, M. (ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, New York-London, Macmillan, 1987.

ELLIS, D.M., *Astudiaeth o Enwau Lleoedd Sir Drefaldwyn*, unpublished MA Thesis, University of Wales, 1935.

EVANS, D.E., *Gaulish Personal Names, A Study of Some Continental Celtic Formations*, Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1967.

EVANS, D.S., *Aneirin - Barddd Cristnogol?*, «Ysgrifau Beirniadol», X, 1977, pp.35-44.

EVANS, E. *Some Specimens of the Poetry of the Ancient Welsh Bards*, London, R. and J. Dodsley, 1764.

FLEURIOT, L., *Les Origines de la Bretagne*, Paris, Payot, 1980.

FORBES, A.P., *Kalendars of Scottish Saints: with personal Notices of those of Alba, Laudonia and Strathclyde*, Edinburgh, Edmonston & Douglas, 1872.

—, *Notes sur le celtique antique: 1. Traductions latines d'epithètes divines gauloises*, «Études Celtiques», XIX, 1982, pp. 121-126.

Geiriadur Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1950-

GOURVIL, F., Noms de Famille de Basse Bretagne, Paris, Editions D'Artrey, 1966.

GOVER, J.E.B., The Place-names of Cornwall, Cambridge, University Press, 1948.

HAYCOCK, M., The Significance of the «Cad Goddau» Tree-list in the Book of Taliesin, in Celtic Linguistics. Reading in the Brythonic Languages. Festschrift for T. Arwyn Watkins, ed. M.J. Ball – J. Fife – E. Poppe – J. Rowland, Amsterdam-Philadelphia, J. Benjamins Pub. Co, 1990, PP. 297-331.

—, Blodeugerdd Barddas o Ganu Crefyddol Cynnar, Swansea, Cyhoeddiadau Barddas, 1994.

ISAAC, G.R., Mynyddawg Mwynfawr, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», XXXVI, 1990, pp.111-13.

— review of KOCH, The «Gododdin» of Aneirin, «Llên Cymru», XXII, 1999, pp. 138-160.

—, «Trawsganu Kynan Garwyn mab Brochuael»: a tenth-century political poem, 1999.

JACKSON, K.H., Language and History in Early Britain: a Chronological Survey of the Brittonic Languages, 1ᵉʳ to 12ᵗʰ c. AD, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1953.

—, The Gododdin: The Oldest Scottish Poem, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1969.

—, Gildas and the Names of British Princes, «Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies», III, 1982.

JARMAN, A.O.H. (ed), Aneirin: Y Gododdin. Britain's Oldest Heroic Poem, Llandysul, Gomer, 1988.

JOHNSON, S., Later Roman Britain, London, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1980.

JONES, E., Musical and Poetical Relicks of the Welsh Bards, London, the author, 1794².

KOCH, J.T., *«Cothairche», Esposito's Theory, and Neo-Celtic Lenition', in Britain 400-600: Language and History, ed. A. Bammesberger – A. Wollmann, Heidelberg, Winter, 1990, pp. 179-202.

—, Thoughts on the «Ur-Gododin»: Rethinking Aneirin and Mynyðawc Mwyn-vawr, «Language Sciences», XV, 1993, pp. 81-89.

—, The «Gododdin» of Aneirin. Text and Context from Dark-Age North Britain, Cardiff-Andover (MS), University of Wales Press-Celtic Studies Publications, 1997.

LOTH, J., Chrestomathie Bretonne (Armoricain, Gallois, Cornique), Paris, Bouillon, 1890.

MAC CANA, P., *Votepori, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», XIX, 1961, pp.116-117.

MAC MATHÚNA, L., Old Irish Heights and Word-Field Potential, «Studia Hibernica», XXIV, 1988, pp. 37-44.

MADEG, M., Renabl Anoiou Kêriadennou Bro-Leon hag o Distagadur, Brest, Engleo Breiz-Ar Skol Vezoneg, 1996.

NASH-WILLIAMS, V.E., The Early Christian Monuments of Wales, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1950.

NICHOLAISEN, W.F.H., The Picts and Their Place-names, Inverness, Groam House Museum, 1996.

PADEL, O.J., A Popular Dictionary of Cornish Place-names, Penzance, Hodge, 1988, pp.118-19.

PARRY, T. (ed.) Gwaith Dafydd ap Gwilym, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1952.

POKORNY, J., Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch, Bern, Francke, 1949-1969 2 vols.

POWEL, T. (ed.) The Gododin of Aneurin Gwawdrydd, London, Whiting & co., 1888.

SKENE, W.F. (ed), The Four Ancient Books of Wales Containing the Kymric Poems Attributed to the Bards of the Sixth Century, Edinburgh, Edmonston and Douglas, 1864-1868.

STOKES, W. - STRACHAN, J. (ed), Thesaurus Palaeohibernicus, Cambridge, University Press, vol. I, 1901.

TANGUY, B, Dictionnaire des noms de communes, trèves, et paroisses du Finistère: origine et signification, Douarnenez, Le Chasse Marée, 1990.

TURNER, S., Vindication of the Genuineness of the Ancient British Poetry of Aneurin, Taliesin, Llywarch Hen, and Myrddin, London, E. Williams, 1803.

VILLEMARQUE, T.H. DE LA, Bardes Bretons: Poèmes du VIᵉ siècle, Paris, Didier, 1860.

WATSON, W.J., The History of the Celtic Place-names of Scotland, Edinburgh-London, William Blackwood & Sons, 1926.

WILLIAMS, I., Dwy gân o Lyf Coch Talgarth, «Bulletin of the Board of Celtic Studies», II, 1924, pp. 118-30.

— (ed) Canu Llywarch Hen, Caerdydd, Gwasg Prifysgol Cymru, 1935.

— Enwau Lleoedd, Liverpool, Hugh Evans, 1945.

—, The Beginnings of Welsh Poetry, Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1972 [ed. R. Bromwich].

WILLIAMS AB ITHEL, J., Aneirin. Y Gododin: A Poem on the Battle of Catraeth, Llandovery, W. Rees, 1832.

Later Irish influence

Irish influence in Welsh toponyms is well-evidenced following the initial period of Irish settlement of the fifth to sixth centuries, especially on the Welsh church. In later centuries Welsh saints' *Lives* sought an Irish equivalent to their saints and to note their cults in Ireland. At the same time, Welsh clerics sojourned in Ireland by for educational purposes (cf. the *caelibes als colideos vocant* living on Bardsey *c.* 1191).[77] This influence is understandable when one considers the size of Wales, its generally inimical relationship with England and the English, and the historical ties of the Welsh and Irish churches. Amongst Welsh churches with Irish cults, the most obvious is the common *Llansanffraid*, but others are typical of Goidelic not Brittonic, and in the case of *Colman* with syncope of the medial syllable betray their Irishness, in the case of *Colman* with syncope of the medial syllable typical of Goidelic not Brittonic, and in the case of *Padrig*, with the lack of affection of vowel **Pedrig*, which shows it to be a loan later than the development of internal vowel affection of the late seventh century.[79] *Cwyfen* and *Ffinan* are names explainable only as derivatives of the Old Irish personal-names *Cóemgen* and *Fintán*.[80]

Ó Riain's recent equation of all Cardiganshire saints whose name contain the element *gwyn*––i.e. *Gwynmwys, Gwynnen, Gwynllau, Gwyndaf, Gwenog*[81]––with 'local realizations' of the cult of *Finnian*, who was the tutor of Columcille (†597),[82] as well as his equating of *Findbarr/Finnian* with other Irish saints with *finn*– (i.e. *Findlug* and *Fintan*) strains credulity, especially as no other unambiguous evidence supports such identifications being made. I thus disagree with his general thesis that: '... Irish influence on the saints of Cardiganshire has largely been obscured by the effects of localization.'[83] In a number of instances

77 Giraldus Cambrensis, *Itinerarium Kambrie* II §6 (ed. Dimock, p. 124). 78 The form of the Denbighshire *Llanguyfan* has final <–a–> even though in the thirteenth-century tract *Bonedd y Saint* the form is given as *Kuyven*, Bartrum, *EWGT*, p. 61. 79 Jackson, *LHEB*, pp 609–11. Jackson's conclusion that it is earlier is based on the arguable premise that Middle Welsh (sic) *eneidfaur* is a direct reflex of fifth-century *Anatemori* (< CC. **Anatiomaros*) rather than a simple composition of *enaid* and *maur* (in fact GPC, s.v. *eneidfawr*, gives the first attestation of *eneidfawr* as of 1829). We can discount Jackson's special pleading (*LHEB*, p. 609), that 'there is ... no reason to suppose W. *Padrig* is not ancient, lacking affection under the influence of the Latin.' The medieval toponym *Llanbadrig*, the most reliable Welsh attestation, suggests *Padrig* stands for the Irish Patrick as it lies on the Anglesey coast facing Ireland. 80 The saint *Byrnach* found in Middle Welsh as *Bernach* and in the toponyms *Llanfyrnach* (Pembs.) and *Llanffyrnach* (Brecs.) was traditionally said to have been an Irishman. Despite this, and the Irish appearance of his name, I have not found any similar name in Old or Middle Irish sources, though it might be an epithet turned name, as the epithet *bernach* 'gapped (teeth)' is found in *Diarmait Bernach*: DIL, s.v. *bernach*. 81 Indeed the name *Gwenog* most emphatically does not contain *gwyn* 'white' or its feminine version. See Wmffre, *PNC*, pp 265–6. 82 Ó Riain, 'The saints', pp 381–3. 83 Ó Riain, 'The saints', p. 378. See also

treating the influence of the Goidels and the Britons on each other Ó Riain displays an unsatisfactory treatment of Brittonic phonology which vitiates his conclusions that the Irish church had a formative influence on the early British church, but for reasons of space I will have to demonstrate this elsewhere.

Conclusions

The foregoing should be sufficient to demonstrate that no direct connection can be proven between toponyms and Irish colonization of the fifth to sixth centuries. It therefore follows that the actual areas of settlement of the Irish in those far-off times cannot be illustrated by the distribution of *cmoc* toponyms – *pace* the assertions of most scholars who subsequently quote Richards' 1960 study. Another reason for doubting the use of these particular place-name elements to prop up theories on where the Irish settled is the fact that these terms are not generally found in the oldest place-names, that is to say common names such as *Pencnwc* and *Penfedw* are found more often applied to little cottages than to the substantial farms which usually continue medieval landholdings.

Coplestone-Crow views the lack of ogam inscriptions and the abundance of Irish toponymic terms in Cardiganshire as indicating settlement by Irish colonists without an aristocracy against areas such as Breconshire with many ogam inscriptions and a lack of Irish toponymic terms as indicating an aristocratic hegemony.[84] Welsh toponymy gives no basis for such a conclusion. Careful sifting of the toponymic evidence leaves one with the conclusion that the undoubted Irish post-Roman implantation in Wales has hardly left a trace in Welsh toponymy. This enables us to hypothesize that the nature of the Irish implantation in the fourth–sixth centuries may have been an aristocratic domination of Brittonic populations to which was probably added local pockets of scattered colonies of Irish-speakers, rather than a wholesale settlement by Irish-speaking peoples with a concomitant displacement of the Brittonic populations (though the toponymic evidence does not exclude the latter possibility).

Jankulak, below, pp 143–4. 84 Coplestone-Crow, 'The dual nature', p. 17.